

**TESTIMONY FROM NYCHA EXECUTIVE VICE PRESIDENT FOR CAPITAL
PROJECTS RAYMOND RIBEIRO
PROVISIONAL HEATING SYSTEMS IN THE WAKE OF SANDY
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC HOUSING WITH THE COMMITTEE ON RECOVERY
AND RESILIENCY
THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 27, 2014 – 10:00 AM
CAREY GARDENS COMMUNITY CENTER, BROOKLYN, NY**

Chairman Ritchie Torres and Chairman Mark Treyger, members of the Committees on Public Housing and Recovery and Resiliency, other distinguished members of the City Council, and public housing residents, good morning. Thank you for the opportunity to discuss the mobile heating systems installed at New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) developments impacted by Superstorm Sandy. I am Raymond Ribeiro, Executive Vice President for Capital Projects. Joining me today are Carlos Laboy-Díaz, NYCHA's Executive Vice President for Operations, and other members of NYCHA's team.

This morning, I would like to address a number of issues stemming from the Authority's use of mobile heating systems in the aftermath of Superstorm Sandy. I will also address how these systems fit into the provision of heat and hot water at NYCHA developments during our efforts to build more resilient infrastructure. I would like to stress that we have very clear plans to permanently replace the mobile boilers in a way that is smart, safe and more dependable for residents, while emphasizing that we are fighting for every dollar to make those plans a reality, and we remain a long way from achieving our goal.

Procuring the Mobile Boilers, Assessing the Damage, and Working to Become More Resilient

As every New Yorker knows too well, Superstorm Sandy caused great destruction in places across New York City, and at many NYCHA developments. Eighty thousand of our residents in 423 buildings were significantly affected, many of whom are still feeling the impact more than one year later. In the weeks following Sandy, my colleagues and I worked around the clock to bring heat and hot water

back to residents by restoring dozens of existing boilers and installing 23 mobile boilers. In some cases, repairing the infrastructure in place proved to be impossible, as salt water damaged parts beyond repair.

In order to secure the mobile boilers, we first focused locally by relocating mobile boilers from our regular construction program. We then procured 21 additional mobile boilers from as far as Texas. Prior to installation, we ensured that they would work with NYCHA's infrastructure - low pressure versus high pressure, or be appropriately sized with the right horsepower and we deployed electricians, plumbers, welders, and steamfitters to install the necessary connections. Permitting issues, weight restrictions, and difficult transportation within the devastated Tri-State Area made delivery challenging.

Although a destructive event, Superstorm Sandy offered an opportunity to pursue a more resilient, sustainable future. Very early on in the aftermath of the storm, once we had completed basic repairs to our damaged systems, we made a determination that it would be irresponsible to simply repair or replace boilers back in the basement locations. That approach would potentially compromise our infrastructure, and residents would remain vulnerable during future extreme weather events. This finding came after a detailed examination of how our entire organization - buildings, employees, residents, and equipment - performed during Sandy, and how they can become better prepared for future emergencies. As part of this effort, we conducted detailed and thorough assessments of each boiler affected by the storm. We examined the extent of their damage and analyzed replacement costs. And we evaluated plans to make our infrastructure generally more resilient to future disasters or extreme weather events. At the time of the assessments, if we had decided to simply repair in place and if we only wanted to rebuild for short-term expediency instead of long-term sustainability, the replacement of the boilers would be completed. Our commitment to do what's most resilient rather than what's easiest is a message that we have been communicating to various stakeholders.

We have developed comprehensive plans for the safer, more resilient, more dependable infrastructure I mentioned a moment ago. For some of our developments, we want to raise the boilers and electrical equipment and house them in separate building extensions or stand-alone buildings. For other developments, we propose advanced resiliency efforts such as central boiler plants, or combined heat and power plants that provide backup electricity. At others, we propose alternate options such as insulated façades that reduce heat load and preserve the building's envelope.

The Funding Needed for a More Resilient Tomorrow

NYCHA is aggressively pursuing the funding needed to build this better infrastructure from multiple sources, including insurance, FEMA, the Hazard Mitigation Grant program, and the Community Development Block Grant Disaster Recovery (CDBG-DR) program. We are working with the New York City Department of Buildings (DOB) for regulatory support related to that funding. NYCHA, together with other affected agencies, are working to justify the boiler replacements to ensure the most resiliency possible. Despite these efforts, the Authority remains without sufficient commitments to realize our resiliency plans.

This uncertainty and lack of funding, seriously impacts the design and execution of repairs and resiliency efforts. Without knowing how much of our resiliency efforts will be funded, we cannot begin the requisite final design, procurement, and construction processes to replace our mobile boilers in the optimal way. And without the money we need for true resiliency, we'll have to simply return the boilers to their previous locations, putting them at high risk for damage from future disasters and threatening residents' quality of life.

Current Status of the Mobile Boilers

Currently, there are 24 mobile boilers serving approximately 8,800 families in 110 buildings at 16 developments. There are also two backup mobile boilers at

Surfside. Since installing the mobile boilers, NYCHA has paid a total 55.8 million dollars. This includes approximately 18.2 million for rent, 33.6 million for fuel and \$4 million for installation. The mobile boilers are housed in self-contained trailers or temporary structures. Power and steam distribution lines connect them to the permanent systems for the buildings. In addition, temporary piping is in place for fuel supply, water supply, and condensate return lines. Basically, the mobile boilers generate steam which is then distributed via the existing infrastructure in the buildings.

The mobile boilers are just as effective at producing steam heat as regular boilers and have sufficient capacity to serve the needs of the developments. In some cases, their horsepower ratings exceed regular boilers. The only difference is in how they interact with the steam distribution system. To clarify, existing boiler rooms have backup systems, which the mobile boilers currently lack. When a permanent boiler fails, staff, utilizing backup systems, makes manual adjustments to compensate. The automated distribution systems that boilers utilize were also damaged by Sandy. Therefore the distribution systems are now manually regulated, according to the outside temperature. For this reason, residents may experience fluctuations in heat distribution. By separately tracking heat and hot water complaints related to the mobile boilers, we determined that there is a minor difference in the number of complaints received about them. We attribute this slight difference to the extremely cold weather we've experienced this year.

The mobile boilers will be in place for at least two more heating seasons contingent on funding commitments, completion of designs, and construction. We are often asked why we are unable to proceed with design without funding commitments. Design costs typically make up 10 percent of the construction costs. Therefore, it is not cost efficient to design without funding guarantees.

Lessons Learned

We've learned important lessons as a result of this winter's extreme cold weather, and are applying this knowledge to the provision of more effective service from the mobile systems. In early January, amid a significant winter storm with blizzard-like conditions and record-breaking cold temperatures, various boiler components froze. Despite the extreme weather conditions, staff worked continuously to restore service, replacing the broken components and thawing frozen sections with portable space heaters. Learning from this incident, we bolstered weatherization by insulating their enclosures and all water lines, installing heaters to keep key components from freezing during frigid weather and heat trace lines on all water piping. In addition, we fortified the heating systems for both O'Dwyer and Surfside Gardens by connecting them, installing over 300 feet of above-ground steam lines and establishing two additional backup mobile boilers at Surfside. This means that there will be a backup in case a boiler goes out at either location. While the mobile boilers have always been continuously monitored and maintained, we also increased the number of staff responsible for monitoring them during cold snaps. These key lessons learned allowed us to work through a second cold snap in Mid-January without any major disruptions.

At all locations that utilize mobile boilers we are currently replacing oil burning systems with natural gas systems. As I previously mentioned, these new boilers will have built-in backups in case an individual boiler must go offline for general maintenance and repairs. Switching to natural gas will make fuel supply more efficient, since our developments already receive gas through existing pipelines. Also, natural gas is a cleaner-burning fuel – an important benefit for residents – and more environmentally friendly.

Keeping Residents Informed and Engaged

Residents are NYCHA's most critical partner throughout our efforts to address the day to day maintenance of the temporary systems and our most important stakeholder as we aim to rebuild smarter and more resilient and sustainable systems in the future. Since the storm subsided, we have consistently sought the input of NYCHA residents, and have worked very hard to provide them with up-to-date information. In addition to the newsletters that we distributed on a quarterly basis in four languages to residents of Coney Island, Red Hook, and the Rockaways in the year following the storm, we published a special edition on Sandy's one-year anniversary that provided more information about the mobile boilers and their replacement. Just this past Tuesday we conducted a meeting with the Resident Association Presidents of all developments served by mobile boilers to update them on the status of the boilers. Additional meetings will be scheduled at the individual developments for all residents to provide input on preliminary design concepts in the coming months.

Conclusion

While NYCHA has worked to protect residents, our staff, properties, and infrastructure against potential emergencies, more needs to be done. Funding is necessary for us to recover from Superstorm Sandy's destruction in a way that is smart and provides a strong foundation for the future. Until that funding is committed, we are doing everything we can. We have met with many elected officials to discuss specific needs at individual developments – and we will continue to do so. If provided to us, City capital dollars can be leveraged with any recovery funds we receive to help address those needs. Also, we ask that you advocate for additional State and federal funds that will help us accomplish our resiliency work.

We look forward to working on these very important issues with the Mayor and City Council. Partnership – with elected officials and other key stakeholders – is a

Repairs with Major Resiliency



Stand Alone Boiler Room



www.CVHaction.org

Ann Valdez

Resident Gravesend Houses & Community Voices Heard Member-Leader
NYC Council Public Housing & Recovery and Resiliency Committee Hearing in Coney Island
February 27th, 2014

Good afternoon. My name is Ann Valdez and I am a resident of Gravesend Houses and have resided in public housing for 47 years. I am also a member-leader with Community Voices Heard and a member of the People's Coalition of Coney Island. Thank you to Council Members Ritchie Torres and Mark Treyger and the Public Housing and Recovery and Resiliency Committees for holding this hearing today, bringing it to us rather than having us have to come to you, and letting the public testify first.

Community Voices Heard (CVH) is a membership organization of low-income people, predominately women with experience on welfare, building power in New York City and State to improve the lives of our families and communities. Our work in public housing began 6 years ago as we noticed the growing number of issues that needed to be addressed especially the national disinvestment in public housing. This disinvestment has affected NYCHA greatly and, as a result, public housing residents as well.

Since Hurricane Sandy, CVH has been bringing together our members across the 3 affected communities (Far Rockaway, Red Hook, and Coney Island) to make sure the needs of NYCHA residents are getting addressed in this moment of rebuilding. We are working on a report – with other partner groups - that will be released in 2 weeks on these issues. We are also a member of the Alliance for Just Rebuilding – a coalition of community, labor and faith groups organizing to make sure that the rebuilding addresses the inequities of the past and includes rebuilding the human infrastructure, too....people like me!

When Sandy hit, I can remember feeling a great sense of loss and worry. As we were evacuated from our homes in public housing and moved to shelters, the thought of not being able to return home plagued many residents. In the days after the storm, as we were allowed back in our homes, we now had to deal with no heat or hot water, spotty electricity, and some places in Coney Island had to deal with darkness.

New York City (main office)

115 East 106th St.,
3rd Floor
New York, NY 10029
Tel: 212-860-6001
Fax: 212-996-9481

Yonkers

28 N Broadway,
2nd Floor
Yonkers, NY 10701
Tel: 914-751-2641
Fax: 914-751-2642

Newburgh

18 Lander St.
Newburgh, NY 12550
Tel: 845-562-2020
Fax: 845-562-2030

Poughkeepsie

29 North Hamilton St.,
Suite L03
Poughkeepsie, NY 12601
Tel: 845-790-5945
Fax: 845-790-5946

The residents of public housing soon received temporary generators and boilers to restore hot water and heat. I couldn't help but wonder three things: first was wondering when another hurricane might hit, second how was NYCHA going to begin address the growing mold issues (that's for another hearing), and then, as times passed, the final thought was where would these boilers be put permanently so that we wouldn't have the same problem again.

The response by government and by NYCHA has been slow. Here in Coney Island, we almost feel like we've been abandoned. It barely looks like anything has been fixed out here; in fact, we just saw people cleaning some trees up this week...as if they were preparing for this hearing. Here in the community, we're the ones cleaning everything up. We're looking at creating more community gardens, and we could use more support in doing this. We're ready to pitch in, but we need government partnership to do it.

We're still on temporary boilers, apartments are not fully fixed, nobody on the 1st floor has moved back into their apartments. Work needs to be done to get these temporary boilers out of here and put in place something permanent. And, while they're doing this, they should be thinking about building back in a more resilient way that's energy efficient and green, and helps NYCHA save money to invest in much-needed repairs.

As we just passed the one year anniversary of Hurricane Sandy, NYCHA needs to replace the temporary boilers and move all the boilers and critical wiring systems of Zone 1 developments to higher ground. While NYCHA has recognized the importance of this recommendation and proposed a similar measure, due to funding constraints 16 NYCHA developments still have 24 mobile boilers and none have been raised above flood levels. We encourage NYCHA to prioritize this work and to continue to advocate for funding so it can be completed as soon as possible.

The influx of federal Sandy funds presents a unique opportunity to put NYCHA buildings on the forefront of energy efficiency and to benefit residents while our improvements are made. CVH is working with the Alliance for a Greater New York and other groups to think about how NYCHA can set a new standard with its rebuilding. Why don't we rebuild back better...on all fronts?

Some key things to look at are:

- ☐ Employing residents at every opportunity as we rebuild the boilers and the generators. Let's see something better than Section 3 put in place and residents get the jobs that are created.
- ☐ Make a system that is capable of operating as a micro-grid that can separate from the city's grid, such as Co-Op City's. That way our system will work even when the main system isn't.
- ☐ Make sure CDBG-DR funds are equitably distributed...and that NYCHA residents benefit from these rebuilding funds as much as home-owners and renters in private buildings.

Thank you for allowing me the time to speak and we look forward to working with you as we rebuild and ensure that public housing can last through the next storm.



Testimony of Red Hook Initiative's Lead Community Organizer, Alisa Pizarro

NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL PUBLIC HEARING

Provisional Heating Systems in the Wake of Sandy: How are they working at NYCHA developments and how long will they be in place?

Thursday, February 27, 2014

Carey Gardens Community Center, 2315 Surf Avenue, Brooklyn, NY

Hello. My name is Alisa Pizarro. I have lived in the Red Hook Houses for 23 years and raised my two daughters there. I have worked as a Community Organizer at the Red Hook Initiative for the last seven years. After Hurricane Sandy I had no running water, heat and electricity for 3 weeks. During that time, I worked over 10 hours per day at the Red Hook Initiative to ensure that my neighbors got food and supplies, information, medical attention, and emotional support.

Today, 16 months after the storm, we still have six temporary boilers at the Red Hook Houses that are providing heat and hot water to multiple buildings. These boilers are loud and are blocking walkways. Despite being active in the community, **those of us here today have no sense of when the temporary boilers will be replaced with a permanent, reliable, and resilient system.**

In late 2013 RHI and Community Voices Heard conducted a survey of 500 NYCHA residents in Red Hook, Coney Island, and the Lower East Side. In each of our NYCHA communities residents expressed frustration with wait times for repairs, persistent mold, temporary boilers, excessive scaffolding around the Houses, and a lack of information on the status of the temporary boilers and other resiliency plans. We deserve better.

Our recommendations to this committee are as follows:

- 1) Demand that NYCHA publish a plan that details when and how they will complete the installation of more permanent and stable systems.
- 2) Insist that the new boiler systems and critical wiring components in Zone 1 developments like Red Hook be raised above current flood levels, and that NYCHA prioritize this work and dedicate resources or advocate for necessary funding to complete these vital improvements.
- 3) Recommend that NYCHA improve their tenant communication systems. Residents deserve to know what to expect in regards to temporary boilers, housing repairs, and mold removal plans.

After the traumatic events of Hurricane Sandy, residents of the Red Hook Houses would like to believe that NYCHA is working with us and for us to create a safer, more resilient housing development.

Thank you.

The Red Hook Initiative (RHI) is a community center in Red Hook, Brooklyn that serves over 1,500 Red Hook residents annually. Founded in 2002, RHI believes that social change to overcome systemic inequities begins with empowered youth. RHI's programs focus on youth development and community building. Over 90% of RHI's employees are Red Hook residents. In 2012 RHI won the Nonprofit Coordinating Committee and New York Magazine Excellence in Nonprofit Management Award. For more information go to www.rhicenter.org

767 Hicks Street, Brooklyn, NY 11231 . www.rhicenter.org . 718.858.6782 . info@rhicenter.org



Testimony of the Alliance for a Just Rebuilding before the New York City Council Committees on Public Housing and Committee on Recovery and Resiliency regarding Oversight: Provisional Hearing Systems in the Wake of Sandy: How are they working at NYCHA developments and how long will they be in place?

February 27, 2014

Good afternoon Chairpersons Torres, Chairperson Treyger and members of the Public Housing and Recovery and Resiliency Committee. Thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony today. My name is Nathalie Alegre and I am Coordinator of the Alliance for a Just Rebuilding (AJR). The Alliance for a Just Rebuilding is a citywide coalition of over 40 labor unions, worker centers, and community, faith-based, environmental and policy organizations advocating for a just and equitable short-term recovery and long-term rebuilding in the wake of Hurricane Sandy. Our member organizations collectively represent some of most vulnerable New Yorkers in the areas most affected by Hurricane Sandy and across the five boroughs: low-income homeowners and renters, public housing residents, day laborers, and undocumented immigrants.

I commend the Committees for holding this important Oversight Hearing regarding the continued hardship public housing residents are experiencing through reliance on emergency temporary boilers 16 months after Sandy. AJR believes efforts to bolster resiliency in NYCHA must be addressed quickly but also in a way that is resilient, energy-efficient, and equitable. To that end, we would like to offer the following recommendations to the Committees for consideration in relation to NYCHA and post-Sandy rebuilding and resiliency efforts in general:

1. Request a clear repair and capital improvements timeline from NYCHA. Direct NYCHA to create a timeline and accountability mechanism for public reporting of Superstorm Sandy repair work and rehabilitation as well as capital improvements. NYCHA should ensure that all repair and rehabilitation work is high-quality so that repairs address the root causes of problems.
2. Request that the City leverage CDBG-DR funds from the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development to access additional funding streams for NYCHA. New York City Housing Authority buildings' repairs needs are too great to be fully addressed by the current CDBG-DR allocation. But CDBG-DR funds could be used as the 10% local match required for various FEMA funding programs.
3. Direct NYCHA to create effective job training and placement pipelines for public housing residents. Many NYCHA residents struggle with unemployment and often lack the skills necessary to get high quality employment and build stable careers. In the next few years, NYCHA will invest millions in resiliency improvements to public housing buildings. NYCHA should also invest in pre-apprenticeship programs and advertise job opportunities on Sandy rebuilding projects among public housing residents first.
4. Direct NYCHA to improve emergency communication and invest in community centers as long-term resiliency and economic opportunity centers. The communication between NYCHA officials and

public housing residents before and after Superstorm Sandy was inadequate. Many households were left for weeks without clear communication from NYCHA about what was happening, and few knew how to reach out for help. While this idea has been cited as place for improvement, the city can ensure the true improvement by requiring that any changes to NYCHA's response protocol are created in meaningful collaboration with residents and workers in NYCHA buildings.

5. Direct NYCHA to invest in community centers as long-term resiliency and economic opportunity centers. Over the last decade, many community centers have been closed generally due to lack of funds. In addition to improving the communication protocol, NYCHA can ensure greater access to and reopening of community centers, which were integral to the response to Superstorm Sandy for those buildings that could access them. The Council can ensure NYCHA invest in these spaces either through leasing community centers to community groups or providing regular access and additional resources. These spaces could function as post-disaster convening and relief delivery spaces and as job and employment centers helping to link residents with job training and placement opportunities.
6. Adopt long-term energy efficiency and resiliency measures to preserve and upgrade NYCHA buildings infrastructure. Besides what has already been outlined in NYCHA's CDBG-DR capital improvements proposal, AJR strongly encourages City Council to direct NYCHA to invest in co-generation, solar PV and solar thermal water heating systems as opportunities to enhance resiliency and improve environmental impacts. Part of increased resiliency is to become more energy efficient and when possible producing energy locally that can provide service even if future disaster causes grid failures elsewhere.

Thank you for your attention,

Nathalie Alegre
Coordinator
Alliance for a Just Rebuilding
c/o ALIGN
50 Broadway, 29th Floor
New York, NY 10004
Phone: (212) 701-9472

www.rebuildajustny.org

Alliance for a Just Rebuilding members include: 1199 SEIU, 32BJ SEIU, 350.org, ALIGN, Arts & Democracy, CAAAV: Organizing Asian Communities, Center for Popular Democracy, Center for Social Inclusion, Coalition for the Homeless, Community Development Project at the Urban Justice Center, Community Environmental Center, Community Voices Heard, Consortium for Worker Education, El Centro del Inmigrante, Faith in New York, Families United for Racial and Economic Equality (FUREE), Good Jobs New York, Greater New York Labor-Religion Coalition, Hunger Action Network of NY State, Legal Aid Society, LiUNA Laborers Local 55, LiUNA Laborers Local 78 Asbestos Lead & Hazardous Waste Workers, Long Island Civic Engagement Table, Long Island Jobs with Justice, Make the Road NY, Mutual Housing Association of NY, National Day Laborer Organizing Network (NDLON), National Domestic Workers Alliance, New Economy Project, New Immigrant Community Empowerment (NICE), New York Committee for Occupational Safety and Health (NYCOSH), New York Communities for Change, New Yorkers for Fiscal Fairness, New York State Nurses Association (NYSNA), Occupy Sandy, Participatory Budgeting Project, Physicians for a National Health Program-NY Metro, Pratt Center for Community Development, Project Hospitality, Queens Legal Services, Red Hook Initiative, Respond & Rebuild, Retail Wholesale and Department Stores Union (RWDSU), Solidarity NYC, TWU Local 100, VOCAL-NY.



50 Broadway, 29th Floor
New York, NY 10004

T 212 631 0886
F 888 370 3085

www.ALIGNnny.org

**Testimony to the New York City Council Committee on Public Housing and
the Committee on Recovery and Resiliency
February 27, 2014**

Good afternoon. Thank you for the opportunity to provide testimony today. My name is Nathalie Alegre and I am an Organizer at ALIGN: the Alliance for a Greater New York. ALIGN is permanent alliance of community and labor organizations united for a just and sustainable New York.

ALIGN coordinates the Alliance for a Just Rebuilding, a city-wide coalition of over 40 organizations working to rebuild NYC in a just, sustainable and equitable way in the wake of Hurricane Sandy. ALIGN also works very closely with Community Voices Heard to ensure that the rebuilding of NYCHA buildings is done sustainably and that this rebuilding protects existing public housing, increases the financial stability of NYCHA, and creates jobs and economic opportunity for NYCHA residents.

Over 400 NYCHA buildings in Brooklyn, Queens, and Manhattan, with 35,000 residential units housing roughly 80,000 residents, were affected significantly by Sandy. NYCHA's energy systems were destroyed by Sandy and need to be rebuilt immediately. However, they must be rebuilt in a way that is resilient, energy efficient, and equitable. We strongly support the plan to implement combined heat and power (co-generation) at NYCHA buildings, however NYC's proposed 5th Amended Action Plan does not go far enough. It currently recommends combining 10 boilers in three neighboring NYCHA development in Coney Island into a single co-generation plant. This is an important first step, but we believe that any energy system that needs replacing should be done with an efficient and reliable co-generation system.

Where feasible, geothermal heating and cooling systems should be installed to increase the energy efficiency of NYCHA buildings. These systems have a high upfront cost, but pay for themselves in short order. Power Purchase Agreements could be considered as an alternative funding source in certain situations. There is \$297 million in CDBG funds proposed for resiliency measures at NYCHA, including co-generation, detailed plans for this funding are lacking. There are also FEMA funds dedicated to resiliency projects, to which the CDBG funds can be matched.

However, there are still serious budget shortfalls at NYCHA: the Action Plan identifies \$930 million in unmet need for rehabilitation and reconstruction costs, taking into account the first and second round of CDBG-DR allocations. Co-generation and geothermal energy can generate excess electricity that can be sold back into the grid, creating an income-source for NYCHA developments. These systems will also lead to large energy savings, the benefits of which should be passed on the NYCHA and its tenants.

It is important to note that these systems can be delinked from the grid during major storm events. Co-op City has a co-generation system that allowed it to keep the lights and heat on throughout Hurricane Sandy. Such a system addresses the long-term resiliency of

public housing in NYC, and makes the purchase of backup generators pointless. Thus, money could be shifted from buying backup generators to creating energy systems that produce their own energy, even during power failures.

Now I will turn to the issue of equity. Installing resilient energy systems requires that they be elevated. We cannot stress strongly enough that this must not lead to the displacement of a single NYCHA resident. Mayor De Blasio has promised to build an additional 200,000 affordable units. Displacing public housing residents would be contrary to this stated goal. A simple solution is to build free-standing, elevated structures to house these systems, or building them on roof-tops.

NYCHA currently pays a flat rate for its utilities. Thus, any energy savings due to energy efficient systems are unlikely to be returned to NYCHA and its tenants. This payment system must be changed to allow energy savings to benefit NYCHA residents themselves, particularly emphasize fixing existing repair backlogs and deep energy efficiency upgrades.

CDBG funded projects require that 30% of new hires be low-income residents in the area in which the project occurs. NYCHA must improve its outreach program to residents, working with community groups and others to ensure residents are aware of and trained up to take advantage of these job opportunities. We urge partnering with community based organizations, like CVH and GOLES, to help link residents to job opportunities.

We would like to work with City Council members, the administration, and NYCHA leaders to ensure that NYCHA is rebuilt sustainably and equitably. Co-generation and geothermal heating and cooling systems that do not displace a single resident, that save energy and reinvest savings in NYCHA buildings, and that hire local NYCHA residents to do the work is the only sustainable and equitable way to proceed with rebuilding after Sandy.

Lastly, NYCHA's carbon footprint can be drastically reduced through investments in energy efficient systems. This should be a priority of the rebuilding process, since climate change caused Hurricane Sandy in the first place.

Thank you for your time.

Nathalie Alegre
Organizer
ALIGN: The Alliance for a Greater New York
50 Broadway, 29th Floor
New York, NY 10004
Telephone: 212-631-0886

For the Record

1

TESTIMONY OF WE'RE ONE COMMUNITY PRESIDENT, BEN AKSELROD , FEBRUARY 27, 2014

Good morning. Thank you for providing me with this opportunity to share my concern, and the concerns of so many of our fellow New Yorkers, not just in Coney Island, but in every New York City Housing Authority development. NYCHA has a history of relying on band aids instead of cures for dealing with heat and hot water issues. A *Daily News* article in 2010¹, long before Sandy, documents how NYCHA utilized temporary boilers at one Brooklyn development costing \$5,000 a month, while ten months later it had not gotten around soliciting bids for a permanent fix.

Just last May HUD Secretary Shaun Donovan expressed his concerns about NYCHA's effectiveness given that the agency failed to spend \$1 billion in repair funds dating all the way back to 2010³. Add to this over 16,000² open work orders and it is vividly apparent that NYCHA cannot be counted on to do what is in the best interest of its tenants. Yes, Sandy posed monumental problems. However, NYCHA's response was consistent with its modus operandi – being inept. With this agency's embarrassing record, hearings such as today's are vital in assuring that tenants receive the important services to which they are entitled.

It will be the Council's oversight that directs the maximum allowable Sandy aid to NYCHA. It will be the Council's oversight that prods the agency into action. It will be the Council's oversight that verifies that the funds are properly spent. Without the oversight of committees such as yours, NYCHA's tenants will be at the mercy of an agency that time and again has demonstrated it just can't get it right.

Councilman Treyger, I know how involved you were in helping the community recover from Sandy long before you were elected to the Council. Thank you for all that you have already done. On behalf of We're One Community, I am asking that as Chairman of the Committee on Recovery and Resiliency you do two things:

First, you see that New York City and NYCHA receive every cent in Sandy aid to

which they are entitled and then that you remain vigilant to make certain the money is spent expeditiously and timely.

Councilman Torres, thank you for caring enough about the residents of this community to come all the way from the Bronx to conduct this hearing here in Carey Gardens. It is apparent that NYCHA does not take the Boy Scout motto, “be prepared” to heart. While it is most important that we address the issue of temporary boilers and lack of reliable heat and hot water today, I respectfully request that your committee look into NYCHA’s preparedness plan and ability to handle every type of urgency and emergency in the future.

As your Committees work to assure that NYCHA tenants fully recover from Sandy, please go beyond the immediate goal of this hearing to provide every NYCHA tenant with the security of knowing that in the future their landlord will be ready and able to handle whatever contingencies arise.

Thank you.

¹Daily News August 6, 2010 <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/cash-strapped-nycha-spends-5-000-month-portable-donkey-boilers-article-1.200945>

²NYCHA website: <http://www.nyc.gov/html/nycha/html/news/maintenance-and-repair-backlog-action-plan.shtml>

³Daily News article, March 20, 2013, <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/federal-housing-chief-slams-nycha-unspent-1-billion-repair-funds-article-1.1294653>



CITY EMPLOYEES UNION LOCAL 237
AFFILIATED WITH THE
INTERNATIONAL BROTHERHOOD OF TEAMSTERS

216 WEST 14TH STREET NEW YORK, N.Y. 10011-7296
212-924-2000 • www.local237.org

GREGORY FLOYD
President

RICHARD HENDERSHOT
Vice President

RUBEN TORRES
Secretary-Treasurer

PATRICIA STRYKER
Recording Secretary

EDMUND KANE
STEVEN GORDON
CURTIS SCOTT
Trustees



CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE on
PUBLIC HOUSING--OVERSIGHT HEARING
FEBRUARY 27, 2014

**PROVISIONAL HEATING SYSTEMS
IN THE WAKE OF SANDY:**

**HOW ARE THEY WORKING AT
NYCHA DEVELOPMENTS
AND HOW LONG WILL THEY BE IN PLACE?**

***Testimony of President Gregory Floyd,
Teamsters Local 237***

I would first like to thank the Committee and its Co-Chairs, Ritchie Torres and Mark Trayger, for convening this hearing.

I know that we are in the process of considering ways to improve the nation's largest public housing system—once a shining example of civic pride and responsibility—but, I think that it is important to first take the time to pause and review how NYCHA got broken, before we try to fix it.

So, while I applaud Mayor de Blasio's selection for new NYCHA Chair, Ms. Olatoye, as well as the very capable General Manager, Mr. House, I would advise holding that "re-set" button that the Mayor speaks about.....at least for a while.

First, we need to thoroughly study and evaluate what went wrong, before we flick the switch.

As the President of the union with more than 8,000 NYCHA workers—a third of whom are residents as well—we know, first-hand, the problems from two perspectives.

We have offered practical, long- and short-term solutions. And, there's no need for another \$10 million study. Our advice is free!

Today's hearing is concentrating on the heating system-post sandy. But, my problem with the heating system is more of a problem with NYCHA's policies, in general.

In fact, it doesn't matter if we are talking about the post-storm or pre-storm heating system. The biggest problem is that NYCHA outsources the boiler equipment and maintenance contracts. And, of course, we know that outsourcing is not relegated to just boilers.

For a mega-housing complex that dates back over 75 years, and one that affects the lives of so many residents and workers, NYCHA operates as though it doesn't plan on staying in business!

Why hasn't it invested and purchased the boilers?

I want to know the supposed cost-savings of renting them at a sum estimated anywhere from \$10,000 to \$20,000 a month, per development!

Add that up!

Plus, our 450 members who work on monitoring the heating system must rely on these outside contractors for maintenance and repair, which can add to down-time.

Surely, one of the key lessons learned from Superstorm Sandy is that emergency preparedness is critical to positive outcomes. We know that there was little emergency planning pre-Sandy, and, as for post-Sandy, I am still not confident how well the lesson was learned.

Whether we talk of pre- or post-storm, one thing remains the same. It is that the equipment and workers must be able to operate in a workplace that is conducive to quality performance. A workplace must have continuity and incentive that will ultimately streamline response-time, not complicate it.

Our workers should not have any impediments that keep them from performing the job they know so well.

And, residents would benefit the most! They would be able to feel at home in their homes once again.

In summary, to truly take advantage of a “re-set” from NYCHA, the agency’s policies and practices must be analyzed to determine real savings and effectiveness.

Let’s never forget. NYCHA is not only about property, but about people.

500,000 residents and 12,000 workers.

Each have basic needs they desire and deserve.

I am hopeful that someday soon, both can truly feel good about where they live and work.

Thank you for the opportunity to share my thoughts with you today.

February 27, 2014

Good Morning,

My name is Deborah Franklin-Reed, resident leader for Coney Island Houses. We are a 5 building, 14 story complex that rests closer to the ocean than most high rises.

On November 18, 2012, NYCHA issued a statement that power, heat and hot water has been restored to 100 percent of its buildings affected by Hurricane Sandy. The statement also included that while these services have been restored, some residents will occasionally experience service disruptions as generators are disconnected and buildings are re-connected to utility power and as a result of on-going maintenance of the temporary boilers. Residents were told if they experienced any service disruptions, residents should contact NYCHA's Customer Contact Center at 718-707-7777.

I chose to attend this historic hearing today to tell you that public housing residents in all of the affected Hurricane Sandy areas can provide you with the first names of each and operator that works for NYCHA's customer contact center. As resident leaders, we speak to the supervisors of the contact centers and I have cultivated a relationship with each of them. They understood that when I introduced myself, they knew what the call was about.

Surf Side Gardens Site 4 & 5 (located on West 28th Street and Mermaid Avenue) residents reported no heat or hot water beginning on February 15th through February 17th. Residents of 2940, 2950 and 2960 West 31st Street reported a water pipe bursting on February 24th which leads to not having heat and hot water. This site is another site for Surf Side. The senior residents also reported not having proper and adequate heat and hot water prior to the disruption. Residents in Coney Island Houses who live on higher floors reported "warm to cool water and cold pipes in their apartments. Senior residents in the complex have stated how they sleep with extra clothes and blankets just to stay warm, while most report using their ovens to heat their space.

During a general meeting in December, representatives from NYCHA's Capital Department were invited to Coney Island Houses to answer questions about the temporary boilers. Their answers to our questions were ... the problem with the temporary boilers is they are "temporary". Compared to the boiler systems located in the basement of our buildings, they were not strong enough to provide and even distribution of heat and hot water to all 5 buildings and all 14 floors. It was explained that the old system consisted of a 2 boiler system. When one boiler shut down to replenish it, the other boiler would kick in and there was continuity of service. When I inquired as to how long it would be before a permanent system is put in place, the response from the representatives was 2 years. We were told NYCHA is in the process of securing funding to build an elevated platform that would house a 2 boiler system to adequately provide services to the residents of public housing. Of course, we were told to call the customer contact center for any disruptions in service.

That was the un-official report and to date we are waiting for NYCHA to share this plan with the residents in the affected areas. It was good of NYCHA to provide residents with new carbon monoxide detectors, since residents (especially our seniors) will use their ovens to heat their homes, but the residents of public housing need the execution of a plan to restore permanent services while minimizing the potential for future service disruptions. This is just scratching the surface of the problems that plague public housing.

I would like to thank the organizers of this hearing to allow me to be heard and I trust that together we can make live better for residents of public housing.

Deborah Franklin-Reed
President
Coney Island Resident Association, Inc.



Testimony by The Legal Aid Society

Before a Joint Hearing of the New York City Council Committees on Public Housing and Recovery and Resiliency

Oversight — Provisional Heating Systems in the Wake of Sandy: How are they working at NYCHA developments and how long will they be in place?

February 27, 2014

Introduction

The Legal Aid Society, the nation's oldest and largest not-for-profit legal services organization, is an integral part of our City's emergency response efforts. It is more than a law firm for clients who cannot afford to pay for counsel. The Legal Aid Society is an indispensable component of the legal, social and economic fabric of New York City — passionately advocating for low-income individuals and families across a variety of civil, criminal and juvenile rights matters, while also fighting for legal reform. The Legal Aid Society has performed this role in City, State and federal courts since 1876. It does so by capitalizing on the diverse expertise, experience, and capabilities of 1,100 of the brightest legal minds. These 1,100 Legal Aid Society lawyers work with more than 700 social workers, investigators, paralegals and support and administrative staff. Through a network of borough, neighborhood, and courthouse offices in 26 locations in New York City, the Society provides comprehensive legal services in all five boroughs of New York City for clients who cannot afford to pay for private counsel. The Society's legal program operates three major practices — Civil, Criminal and Juvenile Rights — and receives volunteer help from law firms, corporate law departments and expert consultants that is coordinated by the Society's Pro Bono program. With its annual caseload of more than 300,000 legal matters, The Legal Aid Society takes on more cases for more clients than any other legal services organization in the United States. And it brings a depth and breadth of perspective that is unmatched in the legal profession.

Our Civil Practice has offices in every borough of the City, and last year worked on 48,000 individual legal matters that benefited nearly 120,000 low-income children and individuals. An additional two million low-income children and adults benefit from the Civil Practice's pending class action litigation. The Civil Practice works to improve the lives of needy New Yorkers by helping vulnerable families and individuals on issues ranging from health care, housing, homelessness prevention, low-wage worker problems and employment law, education, immigration, foreclosure prevention, consumer law, community economic development, public assistance, immigration, family law and domestic violence, and disability-related issues.

The Society is counsel on numerous class-action cases concerning the rights of public housing residents and Section 8 tenants and is a member of the New York City Alliance to Preserve Public Housing, a local collaboration of New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) resident leaders, advocates and concerned elected officials.

We appreciate the opportunity to testify at this Joint Hearing before the City Council's Public Housing Committee and Committee on Recovery and Resiliency concerning the temporary boilers that have remained in place at NYCHA developments since Superstorm Sandy. We appreciate the leadership of the new Chair of the Public Housing Committee and the chair of the new Recovery and Resiliency Committee and look forward to working with both of you on Sandy issues moving forward.

Sandy's Immediate Impact on NYCHA Public Housing Residents

- 26 NYCHA developments – home to more than 45,000 residents – are in Hurricane Evacuation Zone A (Zone A).
- NYCHA shut down all elevators in public housing developments throughout Zone A and ordered evacuation of all residents in those buildings as of 7 p.m. on October 28, 2012.
- Immediately after Sandy hit on October 29, 2012, 80,000 NYCHA residents were left without power, heat and/or hot water.
- 26 NYCHA basements containing below ground boilers were flooded and submerged.
- NYCHA entered into emergency contracts with electrical contractors to install generators and/or build temporary switch boxes to restore connections to the power grid.
- NYCHA used 24 temporary boilers and approximately 100 generators to restore heat and electricity to its facilities.
- It was not until November 18, 2012, that NYCHA announced that it had restored essential services to 100% of its buildings.
- In the most heavily impacted areas of the Lower East Side, Red Hook, Coney Island and the Rockaways, many NYCHA residents continued to experience problems with intermittent power, heat and hot water and elevator service throughout the City's 2012-13 "Heat Season" because temporary generators and boilers were unable to power full usage by buildings.

One Year After Sandy- What Has Been Done?

- In November, 2013, NYCHA announces estimated Sandy-related expenses of \$1.8 billion, including costs associated with elevating infrastructure and building new utility buildings and including over \$620 million of costs for resiliency measures.
 - On November 20, 2013, NYCHA confirmed that thousands of residents throughout 15 developments remain dependent on 24 temporary mobile boilers to provide heat and hot water.
 - On the same date, Cecil House, General Manager of NYCHA, predicted that it may take another two heating seasons to complete the permanent repair or replacement of temporary boilers.
 - NYCHA has announced that it has contracts in place for the provision of mobile boilers in the event of future disasters.
- On November 20, 2013, NYCHA announced that as of such time, it had received only \$126.3 million from its commercial and flood insurance and \$3.5 million from FEMA. NYCHA confirms that the payments are just a fraction of the funds necessary in order for NYCHA to start addressing its recovery and resiliency efforts.
- The Community Development Block Grant - Disaster Recovery Program (CDBG-DR), administered by the federal Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD), is the main source of federal funds for post-Sandy redevelopment activities. New York City has been allocated \$3.219 billion from the CDBG-DR funds, to be paid in two tranches. The first tranche, approved by HUD in May, 2013, includes \$1.77 billion. On November 18, 2013, the City received a second allocation of \$1.447 billion.
- NYCHA is expected to receive a total of \$308 million from the CDBG-DR funds.

Recommendations:

We are optimistic that the City's new Administration, under the leadership of Mayor de Blasio, will address and resolve the pressing issues faced by NYCHA's residents, many of which result from years of under-funding at the City, State and Federal level.

To that end, we are encouraged by the new Mayor's commitment to redirect resources into NYCHA repairs and maintenance, demonstrated by the announcement made on February 12,

2014, that the Preliminary Budget for FY 2015 relieves NYCHA of the remaining \$52.5 million that would otherwise be owed to the New York Police Department in FY 2014 for the provision of police services under the MOU between NYCHA and NYPD that dates back to 1994.

The Legal Aid Society makes the following recommendations for additional actions —

- (1) NYCHA maintenance teams should continue prioritizing responses to calls from residents who are experiencing problems with heat and/or hot water in their apartments in those developments that continue to remain dependent on temporary mobile boilers.
- (2) NYCHA should grant rent abatements to any residents who experience a loss of heat or hot water in those developments that remain dependent on temporary mobile boilers for the provision of services.
- (3) NYCHA should publish regular updates on the status of its repair and resiliency process — including providing information to residents on the timing of receipt of funds and progress made toward the completion of projects in each affected development. During the prior Administration, residents suffered during and after Sandy as a result of the lack of communication from NYCHA concerning the status of the restoration of essential services. NYCHA needs to provide greater visibility to residents when it comes to the ongoing recovery and resiliency efforts.
- (4) NYCHA needs to act quickly and efficiently when it receives funding from the CDBG grants in order to ensure that resiliency projects involving the installation of permanent boilers are completed and do not become subject to unnecessary delays.

Conclusion

We remain available to work with NYCHA so that we can together ensure that recovery, rebuilding and resiliency efforts are completed efficiently and that the needs of all impacted residents are met.

Thank you again for the opportunity to testify before the joint Committees.

Respectfully Submitted:
Steven Banks, Attorney in Chief
Adriene Holder, Attorney in Charge, Civil Practice
Judith Goldiner, Attorney in Charge, Law Reform Unit
Lucy Newman, Of counsel
THE LEGAL AID SOCIETY
199 Water Street, 3rd floor
New York, New York 10038
(212) 577-3466
lcnewman@legal-aid.org

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Deborah Frankland K. Reed

Address: 3002 Surf Avenue

I represent: CONY ISLAND HORSES

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: 2/27/14

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Goldman Judith

Address: 199 Water St

I represent: The Legal Aid Society

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: MARTIN LEVINE

Address: 2944 WEST 58th 18D Bklyn 11224

I represent: CITY UNIVERSITY OF N.Y. BLDG PERFORMANCE

Address: 137 EAST 22nd ST Rm 315 LAB

NY, NY 10010

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Alisa Pizarro

Address: 80 Dwight St

I represent: Red Hook Houses / Red Hook Initiative

Address: 767 Hicks St, Bk NY 11231

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Sheryl Braxton

Address: 442 Columbia St apt 2C

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: 2-27-14

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: EDWIN Cosme

Address: 1726 Mermaid Avenue

I represent: Concey Island Sports Foundation / People's Coalition

Address: Concey Island / Concey Island Island 2 Trunk

NYS Assemblyman from the 14th Brooklyn District
Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

Maybe

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Parlous, Larry

Address: EVERETT OPERATIONS

I represent: NYCHA CAPITAL Projects

Address: NYCHA

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Ray Ribiero

Address: EVP CAPITAL Projects

I represent: NYCHA

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Evangelina Pugh

Address: 2926 west 25 St

I represent: Coney Island Housing

Address: 2926 west 25 St

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: 2-27-14

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: EVANGELINE BYARS

Address: 2832 West 23 St

I represent: _____

Address: _____

THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. 1 Res. No. B63

☐ in favor ☒ in opposition

Date: 2-27-14

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: W BLOOMFIELD

Address: 2832 W. 23 St Apt 6K

I represent: me & my husband

Address: 2832 W. 23 Apt 6K

THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Bel Kipterman

Address: 111-11

I represent: NY ENV. LAW & JUSTICE PROJECT

Address: 351 Broadway NY NY 10013

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: 02/27/14

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: ILMA JOYNE

Address: 2953 W. 33 St

I represent: O'Dwyer Garden

Address: 2940 W. 33 St

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: 2/27/14

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Greg Floyd

Address: 216 W 14 St NY NY 10011

I represent: Teamster Local 237

Address: 216 W 14 St NY NY 10011

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Shirley Aikens

Address: 2946 W. 23 St

I represent: Carey Gardens

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: 2/27/14

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Ann Valdez

Address: _____

I represent: Community Voices Heard

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Sheila Smalls

Address: 2953 W 33rd ST.

I represent: O'Dwyer Gardens Resident

Address: 2953 W 33rd ST.

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Nathalie Alegre

Address: 50 Broadway

I represent: ALIGN

Address: 50 Broadway

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

Name: Jonathan Gardenhire (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: 182 South Street

I represent: Vice President

Address: Smith Houses

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: 2-27-14

Name: Wanda Feliciano (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: 2007 Surf Ave

I represent: _____

Address: _____

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

Name: Reginald H. Bowman (PLEASE PRINT)

Address: Citywide Council of

I represent: Presidents President

Address: 365 Jackson St

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☐ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Robert Sulecki

Address: 3144 Broadway Apt 6D

I represent: Graveland Houses Assoc.

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms

**THE COUNCIL
THE CITY OF NEW YORK**

Appearance Card

I intend to appear and speak on Int. No. _____ Res. No. _____

☒ in favor ☐ in opposition

Date: _____

(PLEASE PRINT)

Name: Robert Sulecki

Address: 232 Kingston Ave., BK, NY 11227

I represent: Self

Address: _____

Please complete this card and return to the Sergeant-at-Arms